

19<sup>TH</sup> JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT PARISH OF EAST BATON ROUGE STATE OF LOUISIANA 300 NORTH BLVD BATON ROUGE, LA 70801

# 15TH DAY OF OCTOBER, 2021

TO: J. E. CULLENS JR. WALTERS, PAPILLION, THOMAS, CULLENS, LLC 12345 PERKINS ROAD, BUILDING ONE BATON ROUGE, LA 70810

JAMES J DONELON, COMMISSIONER OF INSURANCE FOR THE STATE OF LOUISIANA VS TERRY S SHILLING, ET AL

CASE NUMBER: C-651069

JUDGE: HON. TIMOTHY E KELLEY

**DIVISION:** 22

YOU ARE HEREBY NOTIFIED OF THE FOLLOWING ACTION FOR THE

AFOREMENTIONED CASE: ENCLOSED YOU WILL FIND COPIES OF TWO ORDERS SIGNED ON OCTOBER 14, 2021 BY JUDGE TIMOTHY KELLY.

Thya Meined

DEPUTY CLERK FOR DOUG WELBORN

NOTIFIED:

A SIMONE MANUEL A'DAIR FLYNT ADAM D WHITWORTH ALEXANDER N BRECKINRIDGE V ANDREE MATHERNE CULLENS C AUSTIN HOLLIDAY CATHARINE LUO DAVID R GODOFSKY FREDERIC THEODORE LE CLERCQ GEORGE DAVIDSON FAGAN HARRY ALLAN ROSENBERG HENRY D H OLINDE JR J. E. CULLENS JR. JAMES ALCEE BROWN JENA W SMITH JENNIFER W MOROUX JOHN ASHLEY MOORE JOHN WILLIAM HITE III JUSTIN J MAROCCO JUSTIN KATTAN JUSTINE N. MARGOLIS KARL H SCHMID MATTHEW JOSEPH FARLEY MICHAEL A BALASCIO

MIRAIS M HOLDEN MONICA M. VELA-VICK REID ASHINOFF RICHARD E BAUDOUIN ROBERT B BIECK JR ROBERT J DAVID JR ROBERT W BARTON RYAN K FRENCH SETH A SCHMEECKLE THOMAS M MCEACHIN W BRETT MASON

JAMES J. DONELON, COMMISSIONER : 22 OF INSURANCE FOR THE STATE OF		SUIT NO.: 651,069 SECTION:
LOUISIANA, IN HIS CAPACITY AS REHABILITATOR OF LOUISIANA	:	
HEALTH COOPERATIVE, INC.	1	19 <sup>TH</sup> JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT
versus	:	
GROUP RESOURCES INCORPORATED, MILLIMAN, INC., BUCK GLOBAL,	4 5 7	PARISH OF EAST BATON ROUGE
LLC. AND IRONSHORE SPECIALTY : COMPANY	:	STATE OF LOUISIANA

#### <u>ORDER</u>

A hearing, conducted via Zoom, at 10:30 a.m. on September 29, 2021, was held to consider

Plaintiff's Motion to Compel Milliman ("Motion"). Participating in this Zoom hearing were:

J. Cullens for Plaintiff, the Receiver of LAHC ("Plaintiff" or "Receiver")

Harry Rosenberg, Justin Kattan, Reid Ashinoff, Justine Margolis, Catherine Luo, and Maria Mannarion for Defendant, Milliman, Inc. ("Milliman")

Considering the briefs and pleadings filed by the parties, the exhibits attached thereto which were all admitted into evidence, applicable law, and the argument of counsel, for the reasons stated in open court following this hearing and for those reasons set forth in Plaintiff's original memorandum in support and reply memorandum in support of this Motion, which are incorporated by reference:

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Plaintiff's Motion to Compel Milliman is GRANTED; specifically, Milliman is ORDERED to do the following on or before November 1, 2021:

Answer fully INTERROGATORY NO. 1: Please identify each and every CO-OP, other than LAHC, for which Milliman provided Actuarial Services during the years 2010-2016, by providing the name of the CO-OP, the state in which the CO-OP operated or was expected or intended to operate, and the year(s) during which the Actuarial Services were provided. [Note: To clarify INTERROGATORY NO. 1, the term "CO-OP" refers to any health insurer organized and formed pursuant to the Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act of 2010 ("ACA").]

Produce all engagement letters (signed and executed) that were used to engage Milliman to prepare initial feasibility studies for any ACA CO-OP that hired Milliman for this purpose.

- Produce a complete and accurate copy of all initial feasibility studies that Milliman submitted to the federal government (CMS) on behalf of each ACA CO-OP that hired Milliman.
- Produce all Pro-Forma reports prepared by Milliman for each of the ACA CO-OPs that hired Milliman in 2014 and 2015.
- Produce all of the 2014 rate filings for the individual insurance line of business for each ACA CO-OP that hired Milliman. If multiple filings were submitted, please produce all 2014 rate filings that were filed for each ACA CO-OP that hired Milliman.
- Produce all of the 2014 rate filings for the small group insurance line of business for each ACA CO-OP that hired Milliman. If multiple filings were submitted, please produce all 2014 rate filings that were filed for each ACA CO-OP that hired Milliman.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant, Milliman, shall bear the costs associated with Plaintiff's Motion.

October 14 2021 SO ORDERED this day of October, 2021, at Baton Rouge, Louisiana.

Kell

HONORABLE JUDGE TIMOTHY KELLEY

Donelon v. Shilling, et al., No. 651,069 Sec. 22, 19<sup>th</sup> JDC of Louisiana

Respectful/ abmitted.

J. E. Cullens, Jr., T.A., La. Bar #23011 Edward J. Walters, Jr., La. Bar #13214 Darrel J. Papillion, La. Bar #23243 Andrée M. Cullens, La. Bar #23212 S. Layne Lee, La Bar #17689 WALTERS, PAPILLION, THOMAS, CULLENS, LLC 12345 Perkins Road, Bldg One Baton Rouge, LA 70810 Phone: (225) 236-3636 I HEREBY CERTIFY THAT ON THIS DAY A COPY OF THE WRITTEN REASONS FOR JUDGMENT / JUDGMENT / ORDER / COMMISSIONER'S RECOMMENDATION WAS MAILED BY ME WITH SUFFICIENT POSTAGE AFFIXED. SEE ATTACHED LETTER FOR LIST OF RECIPIENTS.

DONE AND MAILED ON October 13, 2021

Meinel DEPUTY CLERK OF COURT

## RULE 9.5(b) CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify that I first circulated a proposed ORDER to counsel for all parties by email on October 1, 2021, and that counsel for Milliman thereafter agreed to the form of this proposed ORDER prior to filing.

Certified this <u>13</u><sup>+n</sup> day of October J. E. Cullens, Jr.

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing has been furnished via e-mail to all counsel of record as follows, this  $\cancel{13^{++}}$  day of October , 2021, in Baton Rouge, Louisiana.

Harry Rosenberg Phelps Dunbar 365 Canal Street Suite 2000 New Orleans, LA 70130

Reid L. Ashinoff Justin N. Kattan Justine N. Margolis Catharine Luo Dentons US, LLP 1221 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10020

J. E. Cullens, Jr.

JAMES J. DONELON, COMMISSIONER	:	SUIT NO.: 651,069 SECTION: 22
OF INSURANCE FOR THE STATE OF :		
LOUISIANA, IN HIS CAPACITY AS	-	
REHABILITATOR OF LOUISIANA	2	19 <sup>TH</sup> JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT
HEALTH COOPERATIVE, INC.	•	19 JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT
	1	
versus	•	
GROUP RESOURCES INCORPORATED		PARISH OF EAST BATON ROUGE
MILLIMAN, INC., BUCK GLOBAL,	:	
LLC. AND IRONSHORE SPECIALTY :		5
COMPANY		STATE OF LOUISIANA
· · · · ·		

#### **ORDER**

A hearing, conducted via Zoom, at 10:30 a.m. on September 29, 2021, was held to consider Defendant's Motion for Partial Summary Judgment on Unconstitutionality of La. R.S. 22:2043.1(A) as Applied ("Motion"). Participating in this Zoom hearing were:

J. Cullens for Plaintiff, the Receiver of LAHC ("Plaintiff" or "Receiver")

Harry Rosenberg, Justin Kattan, Reid Ashinoff, Justine Margolis, Catherine Luo, and Maria Mannarion for Defendant, Milliman, Inc. ("Defendant" or "Milliman")

C. Austin Holliday for Louisiana Attorney General Jeff Landry

Considering the briefs and pleadings filed by the parties, the exhibits attached thereto which were all admitted into evidence, applicable law, and the argument of counsel, for the reasons stated in open court following this hearing and for those reasons set forth in the Receiver's Opposition Memorandum and the Attorney General's Opposition Memorandum regarding this Motion, which are incorporated by reference:

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Milliman's Motion for Partial Summary Judgment on Unconstitutionality of La. R.S. 22:2043.1(A) as Applied is **DENIED**.

**October 14 2021** SO ORDERED this \_\_\_\_\_\_ day of October, 2021, at Baton Rouge, Louisiana.

Tkell

HONORABLE JUDGE TIMOTHY KELLEY

I HEREBY CERTIFY THAT ON THIS DAY A COPY OF THE WRITTEN REASONS FOR JUDGMENT / JUDGMENT / ORDER / COMMISSIONER'S RECOMMENDATION WAS MAILED BY ME WITH SUFFICIENT POSTAGE AFFIXED. SEE ATTACHED LETTER FOR LIST OF RECIPIENTS. DONE AND MAILED ON October 18, 2021

Donelon v. Shilling, et al., No. 651,069 Sec. 22, 19th JDC of Louisiana

Thyse Mecoul DEPUTY CLERK OF COURT

vi îgi a t

Respectful

J. E. Cullens, Jr., T.A., La. Bar #23011 Edward J. Walters, Jr., La. Bar #13214 Darrel J. Papillion, La. Bar #23243 Andrée M. Cullens, La. Bar #23212 S. Layne Lee, La Bar #17639 WALTERS, PAPILLION, THOMAS, CULLENS, LLC 12345 Perkins Road, Bldg One Baton Rouge, LA 70810 Phone: (225) 236-3636

### RULE 9.5(b) CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify that I first circulated a proposed ORDER to counsel for all parties by email on October 1, 2021, and that after edits and revisions suggested by counsel for the Attorney General were made, counsel for Milliman agreed to the form of this proposed ORDER prior to filing.

Certified this 13 day of October J. E. Cullens, Jr.

# CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing has been furnished via e-mail to all counsel of record as follows, this  $\cancel{3}^{\cancel{4}}$  day of October , 2021, in Baton Rouge, Louisiana.

Harry Rosenberg Phelps Dunbar 365 Canal Street Suite 2000 New Orleans, LA 70130

Reid L. Ashinoff Justin N. Kattan Justine N. Margolis Catharine Luo Dentons US, LLP 1221 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10020

C. Austin Holliday Assistant Attorney General, Civil Division Louisiana Department of Justice P.O. Box 94005 Baton Rouge, LA 70804

J. E. Cullens, Jr.